UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK LEAD CASE 04 Civ. 7922 (KMK) (JCF) : 04 Civ. 9216 (KMK) DIERDRE MacNAMARA, TARASIK ABDELL, : 05 Civ. 8453 (KMK) COREY EASTWOOD, : 05 Civ. 9483 (KMK) COURTNEY LEE ADAMS, : 05 Civ. 9484 (KMK) PETER ALOISIO, : 05 Civ. 9737 (KMK) : 05 Civ. 9738 (KMK) BARBARA ARANEDA, : 05 Civ. 9882 (KMK) DARREN RIGGER, GARTH KAHL, : 05 Civ. 9885 (KMK) Plaintiffs, - against -CITY OF NEW YORK, et al., : : Defendants. JAMES C. FRANCIS IV UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE

ORDER USDC SDNY DOCUMENT ELECTRONICALLY FILED DOC #: DATE FILED:

(ECF)

(JCF)

(JCF)

(JCF)

(JCF)

(JCF)

(JCF)

(JCF)

(JCF)

Plaintiffs having moved by letter of Michael L. Spiegel dated February 12, 2007 to compel discovery, it is hereby ORDERED as follows:

1. With respect to the antiwar demonstrations on February 15, 2003 and March 22, 2003 and the World Economic Forum demonstrations in February 2002, defendants shall produce the requested critiques, after-action reports, and Criminal Justice Bureau analyses of Mass Arrest Processing Plans. These events occurred close in time to the Republican National Convention ("RNC"), and experience gleaned from them informed police strategies for the RNC. The requested documents are therefore relevant. Claims of deliberative process privilege are rejected for the reasons set forth in my Order of March 14, 2007 in MacNamara v. City of New York, 04 Civ. 9216, and claims of law enforcement privilege are rejected for the reasons set forth in my Order of January 19, 2007 in <u>Schiller v. City of New York</u>, 04 Civ. 7922.

2. Defendants may redact irrelevant personal information such as the identification of arrestees. They may also redact information that has no bearing on issues raised in the RNC litigation, provided that they identify in a log or otherwise the subject matter of the redacted portions.

SO ORDERED.

JAMES C. FRANCIS IV

UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE

Dated: Ne

New York, New York April 10, 2007

Copies mailed this date:

Jonathan C. Moore, Esq. Clare Norins, Esq. Rachel Kleinman, Esq. Beldock Levine & Hoffman LLP 99 Park Avenue New York, New York 10016

Michael L. Spiegel, Esq. 111 Broadway, Suite 1305 New York, New York 10006

Jeffrey A. Dougherty, Esq. Special Assistant Corporation Counsel 100 Church Street New York, New York 10007

Fred M. Weiler, Esq. Assistant Corporation Counsel 100 Church Street New York, New York 10007